ECA/PHSD/HRP/91/23[6.1(OA)(a)]

UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR AFRICA
Public Administration, Human Resources
and Social Development Division

# REPORT OF THE NATIONAL TRAINING WORKSHOP ON THE ANALYSIS AND FORMULATION OF HUMAN RESOURCES POLICIES FOR RECOVERY AND SUSTAINED DEVELOPMENT. NIPA, LUSAKA, 9 - 13 DECEMBER, 1991

DECEMBER 1991

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY . . . . . iii

BACKGROUND AND OBJECTIVES . . . . . 1

ATTENDANCE . . . . . 2

OFFICIAL OPENING . . . . . 3

ACCOUNT OF PROCEEDINGS . . . . . 4

HUMAN RESOURCES PLANNING, DEVELOPMENT AND UTILIZATION IN AFRICA: CURRENT STATUS AND NEW POLICY FRAMEWORK . . . . . 4

REVIEW OF THE STRUCTURE AND PERFORMANCE OF THE ZAMBIAN ECONOMY: IMPACT ON HUMAN RESOURCES UTILISATION AND NATIONAL DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES . 8

REVIEW OF THE STATUS AND EFFECTIVENESS OF HUMAN RESOURCES PLANNING INSTITUTIONS AND PROGRAMMES IN ZAMBIA . . . . . 10

HUMAN RESOURCES PLANNING IN ZAMBIA . . . . . 14

ISSUES AND ELEMENTS OF MANPOWER POLICY FORMULATION AND IMPLEMENTATION . . . . . 15
Planning and Programming (17)
Human Resources Development (17)
Human Resources Utilization (17)

TECHNIQUES AND PROCEDURES FOR THE PREPARATION AND CONDUCT OF MANPOWER SURVEYS - THE ZAMBIAN CASE . 19

GROUP REPORT . . . . . 22

A REVIEW OF THE EXISTING NATIONAL MANPOWER PLANNING INSTITUTIONS IN RELATION TO THEIR STRUCTURE, LOCATION, STAFFING POSITION AND FUNCTIONS AS WELL AS THE LINKAGES . . . . . 22
Institutions (22)
Functions (23)
Constraints and proposals for action (23)

EVALUATION OF THE WORKSHOP . . . . . 24

OFFICIAL CLOSURE OF THE WORKSHOP . . . . . 26

APPENDIX A . . . . . 28

TIME TABLE AND WORK SCHEDULE . . . . . 28

APPENDIX B . . . . . 30

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS . . . . . 30

RESOURCE PERSONS . . . . . 30

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. In the wake of the deteriorating socio-economic environment in the African region in the 1980s and its concomitant effect on the human condition, the ECA Conference of Ministers Responsible for Human Resources Planning, Development and Utilisation directed the ECA to assist member-states to develop appropriate human resources planning, development and utilisation systems. The *National Training Workshops on the Analysis and Formulation of Human Resources Policies for Recovery and Sustained Development* were a direct result of the Conference. The workshops are aimed at reviewing manpower and labour market information systems, human resources planning institutional arrangements, etc.; sensitizing and enhancing the knowledge of middle and high level human resources planning practitioners in the analysis and formulation of human resources policies; and making appropriate recommendations to African governments on what courses of action to take so as to improve the human resources policy formulation and implementation processes.

2. The Workshop in Zambia was held under the auspices of the National Institute for Public Administration (NIPA). In all, ten participants -- drawn from the civil-service, Bank of Zambia and ZIMCO -- attended. A summary of the findings of the workshop and its recommendations are given below.

3. On human resources development, evidence presented to the workshop showed that the Zambian educational system, like elsewhere in Africa, was biased towards liberal arts subjects at both secondary and tertiary levels. In addition, enrolment in and the quality of the education system had -- due to economic problems -- registered negative trends in the 1980s. The problems of limited access to secondary and tertiary education due to high attrition rates that aggravated the internal efficiency of the educational system in the country were also cited.

4. The need for making the educational system relevant to the needs of the country was discussed. The 1976 educational reforms which sought to change the concept of education from being white-collar and formal sector employment based to blue-collar and self-employment came to nothing either due to financial constraints or due to the lack of commitment amongst those charged with their implementation.

5. With regard to human resources planning, evidence presented at the workshop suggested that although the Zambian Government had recognised the importance of human resources in national development, the country had no clearly stated national human resources planning, development and utilisation policy. This was further exemplified by the fact that planning in Zambia was budget-driven, that is, priorities were formulated after the Ministry of Finance had made its allocations and the evaluation of the plans were not done in the context of achieving stated national development objectives (such as universal education, reducing child mortality, etc.) but in terms of whether the resources had been spent on the items specified in the budget.

6. In drafting national development plans such as the Fourth National Development Plan

(1989-1993), no particular attention was paid to the human resources dimension of the various projects. The role of human resources management in the successful execution and coordination of the various projects was largely ignored. The Ministry of Finance, it was said, accorded low priority to human resources issues as it seemed preoccupied with achieving short-term financial balances and not long-term perspectives needed for human resources planning, development and utilisation.

7. Due to the lack of a clearly stated national human resources policy, collaboration and coordination between the educational/training systems and the labour market which was necessary for making human resources development relevant to the socio-economic needs of the country had not been possible. The National Commission for Development Planning (NCDP) which is supposed to be the human resources policy formulation and coordinating agency had failed to do so due either to the lack of specialised and qualified human resources practitioners or the lack of a clear legal framework as to whether the agency had the authority to coordinate human resources issues in the country. NCDP had, also, no meaningful interaction with the tertiary educational system and hence the over production of unwanted skills which could not be employed. Meanwhile, the country had been experiencing the shortage of critical skills such as scientific-engineering, management and accountancy.

8. The problem of having no clearly stated national human resources policy had also been compounded by the non-availability of high quality labour market and occupational information that could be used for planning. The Labour Statistics Units at the Central Statistical Office and the Ministry of Labour faced serious financial and manpower problems which made them ineffective.

9. The lop-sided copper mining and exporting economic structure coupled with Zambia's excessive dependence on imported industrial inputs had reduced the country's capacity to create more employment opportunities. The employment problems have been compounded further by high capital intensity and an industrial structure which is dominated by consumer goods and not the production of capital and intermediate goods. The world economic recession which began in the mid-1970s had aggravated Zambia's economic problems through the foreign exchange constraints; debt burden and reduced capacity to import the necessary inputs and consumer goods.

10. As a consequence of the poor state of the economy, the rate of unemployment has risen to over 15 per cent in recent years and the share of the informal sector of the urban labour force had shot up to 77 per cent by 1991. The proportion of the labour force in the formal sector fell from over 20 per cent in 1980 to less than 8 per cent by 1990.

11. In the light of the foregoing concerns the workshop made a number of recommendations aimed at improving human resources planning, development and utilisation in the country. Some of the recommendations made are listed below:

a. the implementation gap had to be narrowed. That is, a lot of recommendation had been made by previous similar workshops and seminars on the imperativeness of human resources policy formulation and implementation but

little, by way of concrete measures, had been done.

b. there was a need for a population policy which would aim at reducing the rate of population growth and, thereby, the check the rapid growth of the labour force.

c. the informal and agricultural sectors need to be strengthened so as to improve their productiveness and linkages with other sectors of the economy and, thus, promote their capacities to generate more productive employment opportunities.

d. the establishment of the tripartite National Manpower Council (NMC) which was endorsed by the previous Government was imperative if human resources policy formulation and implementation were to be enhanced.

e. a rationalisation and a clearly stated legal framework of the institutional arrangements for human resources planning and programming had to be instituted so as to give such institutions a clear sense of mission and to reduce duplication of effort.

f. a clearly stated national human resources policy which spelt out which institution was responsible for what was needed so as to make human resources policy formulation and implementation effective.

g. the human resources data base and information systems needed to be improved and strengthened. In this regard, the Labour Statistics Units at the Central Statistical Office and the Ministry of Labour needed to improve the capability of their personnel and to improve working conditions so as to retain the necessary manpower.

h. the Ministry of Finance and NCDP could move away from budget-driven planning to human centred planning which would measure the success or failure of any plan on whether the human condition had improved or not.

## BACKGROUND AND OBJECTIVES

12. Human resources management encompasses three interrelated managerial efforts. First, one must manage the development of needed skills, knowledge and work attitude. Secondly, the utilisation of the human resources must be managed. Finally, the precess of linking the two for efficiency would need to be managed. In operational terms, therefore, the entire process of human resources management involved a host of managers at different levels all applying various managerial principles, practices and techniques within an integrated system. What was often overlooked by many African governments, either deliberately or accidentally, was that planning at each of the stages provided a useful link in the process of human resources management. Since the effectiveness of the process would depend on the degree and the manner in which the institutions are linked, inter-related and co-ordinated, this oversight could have far reaching negative consequences not only on the status of human resources development and utilisation and the balance between the two, but also on the human initiative within the national development process.

13. The ECA Conference of Ministers Responsible for Human Resources Planning, Development and Utilisation recognised the danger posed by this gap and had, accordingly, called on member-states to develop, with the assistance of the ECA, appropriate human resources planning systems and processes. The national training workshops on the analysis and formulation of human resources policies for recovery and sustained development were a direct result of the Conference. The workshops were also part of the on-going initiatives by African governments to (a) expand and improve the quality and efficacy of the education and training systems so as to cultivate the growing labour force into an efficient instrument for development, and (b) activate and manage conditions in both the labour and product markets for ensuring employment, efficiency and productivity.

14. Workshop participants were, therefore, expected to focus attention on national human resources policies, programmes, strategies and institutional arrangements with the aim of making them more effective. Accordingly, the development objective of the workshop was to enhance and strengthen the staffing and institutional capabilities for the analysis and formulation of human resources policies to improve the development and utilisation of the country's human resources base. Operationally, the workshop was intended to achieve or contribute towards the achievement of the above mentioned objectives by:

(i) reviewing and adjusting, where necessary, existing manpower planning data collection instruments such as survey questionnaires, methods and data processing and dissemination procedures;

(ii) reviewing the existing and specifying the expected functions of human resources planing institutions and personnel and how those functions relate to other functions and staff within the overall national development planning process;

iii) considering the types of data required for human resources planning;

(iv) reviewing, assessing and specifying the administrative and institutional structures and operational linkages and how those relate to other planning structures and institutions; and

(v) reviewing associated issues and procedures/steps for the formulation and implementation of human resources policies.

15. It was anticipated that at the end of the workshop, the following major outputs would be derived:

- the enhancement of at least 15 participants' skills and knowledge in the analysis and formulation of human resources development and utilisation policies, programmes and strategies;
- the strengthening of human resources planning machineries and their linkages with other national development planning and executing agencies; and
- a workshop report containing guidelines, references and recommendations to assist policy makers and national and sectoral human resources planners in Zambia in their work.

16. The contents of the workshop included the following:

- the status of human resources planning, development and utilisation in Africa: a policy framework for improving the management of human resources for socio-economic recovery and sustained development;
- an analytical review of the structure and performance of the Zambian economy in the 1980s and its impact on human resources utilisation and national development objectives;
- a review of human resources planning institutions in Zambia;
- the issues and elements of manpower policy formulation and implementation within the context of Zambia's development priorities; and
- the techniques and procedures for labour market surveys.

17. The workshop was jointly organised by the National Institute for Public Administration (NIPA) and the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa (ECA). The local course co-ordinator with the responsibility of providing the logistic backstopping was Mr Coillard Hamabuyu. The ECA provided the main resource person to service the workshop, Dr Mushiba Nyamazana, at no expense to the Zambian Government.

## ATTENDANCE

18. The workshop was attended by middle-level and senior officials from Cabinet Office (Personnel Division, Directorate of Manpower Development and Training and the Manpower Information Unit), National Commission for Development Planning (NCDP), Bank of Zambia, Central Statistical Office (CSO), Management Services Board, National Institute for Public Administration, Zambia Congress of Trade Unions and Zambia Breweries.[1] The key Ministries of Labour and Social Security; Education; Vocational Training, Science and

[1]See appendix B for the list of participants.

Technology; and Finance did not send representatives.

## OFFICIAL OPENING

19. In his introductory remarks, Mr. Coillard Hamabuyu, local Course Co-ordinator said that the Workshop was as a result of a collaborative effort between NIPA and the ECA. He then called on the Deputy Principal of NIPA, Mr N. Ngulube, to welcome the participants. Mr Ngulube told the participants to feel at home. He urged them to point out to NIPA administration any aspects of the institute which may need to be improved upon. With these remarks he then called upon the Permanent Secretary of Personnel Division, Mr G.K. Kaira, to officially open the workshop.

20. Mr. G.K. Kaira started his speech by noting that the workshop was the first of its kind to be conducted at NIPA. He extended special welcome to the ECA resource person and noted the increased collaboration between NIPA and ECA. He recalled that the same resource person had come to NIPA in September 1991 to jointly (with NIPA) ran a one week workshop on management and organizational development.

21. He observed that the workshop came at an opportune moment when the Third Republic was still in its infancy. That is, the new Government was in a process of auditing and stock-taking policies, procedures, institutional arrangements and the human resources base. In the wake of the budgetary and financial constraints facing the nation, Mr. Kaira said that it was imperative to have an efficient planning system that could ensure a better utilization of the limited resources. The limited resources should be directed into the productive sectors of the economy and into the development and training of human resources. That, he argued, called for increased human resources planning and management in both the public and private sectors.

22. Mr. Kaira went on to state that the workshop was not only aimed at sensitizing the participants but also at imparting knowledge and skills in the analysis and formulation of realistic human resources policies which were needed for improved productivity; realisation of socio-economic objectives and increased technological advancement. He then noted, with satisfaction, the objectives and contents of the workshop. He reminded the participants that, for the week they were to be at NIPA, their main task was to reflect on the existing human resources policies, rules, procedures systems, etc. and on their own individual roles within their respective organisations. He therefore urged them to work very hard and take the deliberations very seriously. He promised to look closely at their evaluation of human resources policies in Zambia and was, therefore, going to study the suggestions and recommendations made in the workshop report.

23. He then urged NIPA, by virtue of its critical role in the development of human resources, to double its training efforts to meet the developmental aspirations of the country.

24. He concluded his speech by urging other donor agencies to emulate the example of ECA in collaborating with NIPA in training ventures. He asked the ECA Resource Person

to convey the Zambian Government's appreciation to the ECA Secretariat for the institutional co-operation, support and links with NIPA.

25. In his vote of thanks remarks, Mr. Richard Lungu of the Directorate for Manpower Development and Training (DMDT), Cabinet Office lauded the workshop's aim of reviewing what human resources planning, development and utilization practitioners should be doing. He also reiterated that the workshop could not have come at a better time as it was taking place just a month after the new Government came into power. He urged his fellow participants to work hard and come up with recommendations which were to be communicated to the Government. He ended his remarks by asking the resource persons to do their utmost to impart knowledge on the course participants.

## ACCOUNT OF PROCEEDINGS

## HUMAN RESOURCES PLANNING, DEVELOPMENT AND UTILIZATION IN AFRICA: CURRENT STATUS AND NEW POLICY FRAMEWORK

26. In presenting this paper, the ECA Resource person started by saying that as a consequence of the economic crisis which engulfed the African continent in the 1980s, many African countries had come to appreciate the importance of human resources in socio-economic recovery and long-term development. Many governments had, therefore, realised the importance of integrating human resources issues such as education, training and employment, public health and sanitation, social welfare and services, etc. in the national development planning process. However, despite this realisation the problems of human resources development and utilization continued to affect many countries in Africa. These problems included reduced investment in human capital due to financial constraints, inability to retain nationals at home (brain-drain), rising unemployment rates, lack of clear-cut manpower policies, limited access to health and other sanitary services; increased food dependency, etc.

27. On reviewing the status of human resources in Africa, the ECA representative looked at manpower planning, education and training, and the health and food situation in the late 1980s and 1990. On manpower planning, he cited evidence from ILO/JASPA studies which showed that many countries in African had no clearly thought out manpower policies. Instead of focusing on important issues such as how to integrate employment and income distribution objectives in the agricultural development, industrialization, incomes and fiscal policies, manpower planning in Africa continued to be preoccupied with the outmoded long-term skilled manpower forecasts.

28. The ECA representative then listed the factors which undermined human resources planning in Africa. These included the lack of clearly defined long-term policy objectives; lack of integration with the national development planning system; inadequate institutional machinery which was in many cases un-coordinated and suffered operational problems such

as financial and manpower constraints; and rapid changes in the socio-economic environment which made planning difficult.

29. On education and training, the ECA representative said that due to the economic crisis of the 1980s, enrolment in the educational system registered an overall negative growth. He also said that the educational system in Africa was still primary based -- primary education accounted for 76 per cent of total enrolment; secondary education 22 per cent and higher education a mere 2 per cent. When compared to other regions of the world, African's educational structure was the poorest: access to secondary and higher education was very low -- a factor which constrained the deepening and widening of the skilled manpower base necessary for recovery and socio-economic transformation. As a result of this limited access and the rapid population growth rates, over half of the adult population in Africa were illiterate and the level of illiteracy was higher among women than men.

30. The educational system, in terms of course offerings, was not reflective of Africa's socio-economic needs. Enrolment in technical and scientific subjects was very low when compared to liberal arts subjects. In the late 1980s, liberal arts subjects accounted for 60 per cent of total enrolment in higher education. This was about the same as in the 1960s when the demand for government administrators was high. He also cited evidence which showed that Zambia was no exception to this general situation. As a consequence, Africa's stock of scientists and engineers was the lowest in the world.

31. Concerning health and the food situation, the ECA representative cited statistical data which showed that over half of the population in sub-Saharan Africa had no access to modern health facilities. In 1990 a third or more of the population had no access to safe drinking water and proper sanitary facilities. Africa's under 5 mortality rate was among the highest in the world. The irony of the situation was that many countries in Africa spent on the military at least 0.08 times (rising to over 2 times in some countries) more than their combined expenditure on education and health. On the food situation, he cited evidence which showed that food production in per-capita and in absolute terms had been on the decline. As such many african countries were dependent on food imports, and that the daily calorie supply as a percentage of requirements was inadequate in many African countries.

32. Regarding wages and employment the ECA representative said that the 1980s registered drastic falls in employment, real wages and the standards of living. While the labour force grew at an average annual rate of 3 per cent between 1980 and 1990, the share of the labour force in wage employment fell from an average of 10 per cent in 1980 to less than 8 per cent in 1990. In the case of Zambia, he cited evidence which showed that the share of the labour force in wage paid formal employment fell from 23 per cent in 1980 to about 9 per cent in by 1990 and that the real wages in 1990 were below those for 1980. Thus, the rate of unemployment rose from about 10 per cent in the 1970s to about 20 per cent in the late 1980s. Real wages, on the other hand, fell at an annual average of about 10 per cent between 1980 and 1990. The causes of these ranged from contraction in economic activities, adoption of structural adjustment programmes, higher rates of inflation, etc., to the lack of productive domestic linkages between industry and the natural resources base. Due to increased rates of unemployment and the fall in real wages, the incidence and spread of

poverty increased on the continent. While the informal sector acted as a major sponge in absorbing the unemployed, its low productivity meant that the incomes generated were not so high as to cushion the region from increased poverty.

33. In the context of the above dismal human resources situation in Africa, the ECA resource person suggested a policy framework for human resources development and utilisation which could promote socio-economic recovery and sustained development. The thrust of the policies suggested included making education, especially higher education, relevant by re-orienting it to problem-solving and changing its structure to bias it more towards scientific training; increasing investment in basic education, health and food security; making human resources planning an integral part of the national development planning process; promoting integration of the agricultural sector with other sectors of the economy with a view to increasing the utilisation of human resources; redirecting resources from the low priority areas such as the military to the crucial ones such as human development sector; pacing emphasis on sectoral and self-employment planning; increased regional co-operation in the establishment of regional technical training centres so as to cut costs of scientific and technical training.

34. The ECA representative concluded his paper by emphasising that unless the policies suggested were implemented, the prospects for improving the human condition in Africa would be minimal.

35. In discussing the paper, participants raised a number of issues which had to be resolved to make human resources management effective. It was felt that collaboration and co-ordination between the educational/training systems and the labour market so as to make human resources development relevant to the socio-economic needs of the country was necessary.

36. It was observed that a lot of seminars on human resources had made recommendations aimed at improving the situation. However, no follow-up nor implementation of such recommendations were ever done. The case of the recommendation of a previous seminar to form a broad-based human resources committee composed of trainers, employers, the government and the trade union movement was cited. The new Government was urged to review this fact carefully.

37. The participants were also not very clear as to which institution - the National Commission for Development Planning or the Ministry of Education, or the Ministry of Vocational Training or Cabinet Office, etc. - they were supposed to address their concerns and recommendations as it was not very clear as to which institution was charged with co-ordinating human resources issues in the country.

38. Some participants felt that the lack of co-ordination among human resources planning practitioners was the fact that many of them were not well qualified to design systematic and well co-ordinated human resources policies and programmes. This fact was exemplified by the lack of human resources planning expertise in the civil-service itself. In 1983 Cabinet Office designated NCDP to co-ordinate human resources policies in the country but the latter

failed to achieve the objective due to the lack of specialised and qualified human resources experts.

39. NCDP, it was observed, had no meaningful interaction with the tertiary educational system and hence the over-production of unwanted skills while critical skilled manpower shortages continued to affect the country. The lack of clear-cut human resources policies were compounded by the non-availability of labour market and occupational data which could be used to analyze the labour market. In the context of the lack of adequate data, the various planning units in the line ministries were irrelevant. The effectiveness of the planning units were also checked by the fact that they have no mandate to determine the human resources requirements of their respective Ministries. Only the Personnel Division at the Cabinet Office had the legal mandate to do so.

40. It was also argued that human resources developments had lost a sense of mission. For example, it was pointed out that the Government had established such institutions as NIPA and the University of Zambia to meet the skilled manpower requirements of the public sector at the time. However overtime this sense of mission had been lost due, mainly, to the fact that there were no jobs (vacancies) which could be matched with the required skills.

41. In drafting the Fourth National Development Plan, no particular attention was paid to the skilled manpower requirements of the various projects which were to be undertaken. The role of human resources management in the successful execution of the projects was completely ignored as was the co-ordination of these various projects. The Budget Office in the Ministry of Finance was singled out for according low priority to human resources issues. The Budget Office, it was argued, was concerned with achieving short-term financial balances and not a long-term perspective needed for human resources planning, development and utilization.

42. The need for a research and development agency to co-ordinate the applied research activities was discussed. The National Council for Scientific Research, it was proposed, could be strengthened to assume this role.

43. On the issue of making education relevant, it was pointed out that the 1976 Educational Reforms which aimed at changing the concept of education from being white-collar and formal sector employment based to blue-collar and self-employment came to nothing either because of financial constraints or due to the lack of commitment to their implementation.

## REVIEW OF THE STRUCTURE AND PERFORMANCE OF THE ZAMBIAN ECONOMY: IMPACT ON HUMAN RESOURCES UTILISATION AND NATIONAL DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES.

44. In presenting the paper, Mr. Stephen Sianga, Director, Human Resources Planning Department, National Commission for Development Planning, started by noting that 1990 and 1991 were the most dramatic in Zambia's post-independence history. Internal and external factors had, over the two years period, necessitated economic and political reforms. To put the employment trend in perspective he undertook a historical analysis of the Zambian economy. Over the 1980s, he said that the main economic problems Zambia faced included stagnated GDP, rapid population growth (which necessitated the decline in real per capita income), lop-sided export-led and externally-dependent economy, chronic government budget and balance-of-payments deficits, foreign exchange constraints, galloping inflation, heavy external debt, high rates of unemployment and deteriorated human resources development services such as education and health.

45. He attributed the above problems to the inherited lop-sided colonial economic structure which had neglected the agricultural sector and the development of indigenous human resources. The heavy dependency on copper mining and exporting continued in the post-independence period.

46. In the post-independence period, Zambia adopted a five-year planning system to correct the economic structural imbalances so as to lay a foundation for the country's development. The Government sought to diversify the economy through import-substitution by adopting such measures as the acquisition of controlling shares in industry by the state, creation of state enterprises (parastatals), protective tariffs, grants, subsidies, etc. To promote social welfare, the government provided free medical, educational and community services. It also exercised price controls.

47. Due to the above measures and favourable world copper prices, the economy registered high rates of growth, in the order of more than 7 per cent per annum between 1964 and 1970. However, by the mid 1970s, such high rates of growth could not be sustained due to the petroleum price hikes of the early 1970s and the slump in the world copper prices in 1975. The foreign exchange constraints that resulted adversely affected the import dependent industrial sector. The lack of productive domestic sectoral integration compounded the problems.

48. The output structure of the manufacturing sector was also biased towards consumer goods as opposed to producing intermediate products and capital goods. The dependence on imported capital goods and intermediate inputs increased the foreign exchange constraints. To reduce this problem, the Zambian government resorted to external borrowing with the hope that the copper prices would recover. They did not.

49. At the time, Zambia's classification as a middle-income country excluded it from concessionary loans and grants. It had to borrow on a commercial basis. However, the

borrowed resources were not invested in foreign exchange generating ventures and hence the debt repayment problems emanated. By 1991, Zambia's external debt stood at over US$7 billion. In the 1980s, Zambia had to adopt structural adjustment programmes of the IMF and the World Bank with a view to increasing the inflow of external resources.

50. On the issue of employment creation, Mr. Sianga noted that reasonable employment growth was achieved in the first two decades of independence. However, the economic crisis of the 1980s negated that achievement. For example, the Third National Development Plan (1979-83) had a target of creating 20,000 new jobs annually over the plan period. This target was not achieved as negative growth (of about 4% between 1980 and 1984) in employment was registered. The agricultural sector was the only sector of the economy which registered reasonable growth in employment. The unemployment problem continued over the 1985-1991 period.

51. Mr. Sianga then defined the informal sector to be made of the subsistence farmers, own account workers and, employers and employees of unregistered business. On the basis of this classification, the informal sector in 1991, employed 1.8 million people (or 77 per cent of the labour force) as opposed to 500,000 people in the formal sector. With a labour force estimated at 2.7 million people, he put the unemployment rate at about 15 per cent.

52. On the structure of the unemployment, he said that the burden of unemployment fell heavily on the 15-25 years old youths who constituted 39 per cent of the unemployed population. In terms of sex, women were more prone to unemployment than men.

53. To the extent that the largely less productive informal sector employed about 77 per cent of the labour force, the problems of under-employment and, thereby, under-utilization of labour were prevalent in Zambia. The reasons which accounted for increased rates of unemployment included rapid growth rates of the labour force; the belief that rapid GDP growth could generate, by itself, more employment opportunities; unfavourable external factors such as the decline in copper prices; the lop-sided economic structure; increased capital-intensity; import-dependent industrial sector whose capacity to expand was dictated by availability of foreign exchange; etc.

54. On the policies needed to reduce the unemployment problems, Mr. Sianga suggested adoption of family planning measures to reduce the growth of the labour force in the long-term. On the structure of the economy, he suggested diversification away from copper-mining to agriculture and industry; increased inter-linkages among the various sectors; and the choice of labour intensive methods of production. He, however, recognised the fact that the restructuring of the Zambian economy was no easy task. A blend of monetary and fiscal policies as well as improving the capacity of the market system to correctly price the various factors were needed. He urged international financial institutions to assist in formulating and designing adjustment packages which took the relevant local factors into account.

55. The discussion of Mr. Sianga's paper centred on the accuracy of the statistics cited, the appointments of heads of parastatal organisations by the President, how to formalise the informal sector and how the unfavourable international economic order has affected the

Zambian economy.

56. The statistics which Mr. Sianga had cited with regard to the percentage distribution of GNP seemed suspect. On page 14 of his paper, he had suggested that the unemployment rates in the rural areas (based on the formal wage-sector definition of employment and not on the production aspect of employment) were exceptionally high. The 99 percent participation rate he referred to on page 18 of his paper was not clear: whether the hard core group referred to were active population or not. The paper also had not addressed itself to its main theme - the impact of economic performance in the 1980s on manpower utilisation and national development objectives - but concentrated, instead, on the historical account of Zambia's economic problems.

57. The poor performance of the economy could also be explained by the lack of skilled and competent manpower, The use of unqualified manpower at high levels was aggravated further by their frequent transfers. More importantly, the appointment of Chief Executives of the public sector institutions did not augur well with systematic management of human resources. Since it was the preserve of the President to appoint who he pleased, be it on merit or otherwise, the fact that such jobs were not open to objective competition (advertisement, interviews,etc) meant that recruitment of competent cadres could not be effected. The new Government, it was said, had already fallen in the same trap of appointing chief executives of parastatal organisations. It was, however, pointed out that such appointments were only temporary (acting-basis) as the posts would be advertised. Despite this, it was unanimously resolved that the same incumbents are likely to get the jobs -- irrespective of whether they qualify or not.

58. Another factor which was responsible for the poor performance of the economy was the fact that the Zambian Government had never been keen to support local initiatives. Until recently, there was a limit to which indigenous businesses were allowed to grow. This was also exemplified by the inadequate support given to the informal sector and small-scale industries. The Government was therefore urged to come up with a policy package to enhance the growth and graduation of the informal sector.

59. On the international economic order, it was observed that arrangements such as the Paris Club had negative implications on budgetary resources in Zambia. The insistence of such institutions necessitated the diversion of resources towards debt repayments and, thereby, reduced the economy's capacity to generate more employment opportunities.

## REVIEW OF THE STATUS AND EFFECTIVENESS OF HUMAN RESOURCES PLANNING INSTITUTIONS AND PROGRAMMES IN ZAMBIA

60. In presenting this paper Mr. Alfred Sampule, Principal Economist, Human Resources Planning Department, NCDP, started by saying that the inability of the Zambian economy to generate productive employment to absorb the ever increasing labour force were due to a

weak economic structure dependent on copper mining and exporting. He observed that the task of employment promotion was inseparable from that of promoting overall economic transformation. He said that one of the critical issues Zambia had to resolve was to set up an effective system for rational planning, development, deployment and utilization of human resources. The Government had, since Independence, realised the importance of human resources in national development. It had created various institutions to deal with the various human resources problems; increased expenditure on education; health etc.

61. He then defined the concept of policy as being "a purposive course of action followed by an actor or a set of actors in dealing with a problem or matter of concern". He pointed out that the mere formulation of a good policy did not automatically result in solutions of the identified problems. Instead, commitment, adequate resources and regular reviews were needed to implement the policies.

62. He cited the ECA's publication which showed that three major considerations should define the direction and scope of a national manpower policy. These included the enhancement of productivity, self-reliance and a strategy for human resources mobilisation, development and utilization of the total population. However, the success of human resources planning depended on a clear definition of who does what in relation to the formulation and execution of human resources programmes. This would enhance better co-ordination, complementarity and ensure a better utilization of resources. It was, therefore, necessary for human resources policies to delineate responsibilities at the national, sectoral and establishment levels.

63. In the context of the foregoing analysis, he said that Zambia had no clearly stated national human resources planning, development and utilization policy. He however noted the fact that Cabinet Office had written circulars concerning training policy in the civil-service which were limited in scope.

64. He acknowledged that employment and manpower concerns had been incorporated in the general economic planning system. He cited the cases of the Third and Fourth National Development Plans (1979-83 and 1989-93) which sought among other things, to create more employment opportunities through labour-intensive techniques; development of the agricultural sector; and speeding up the process of Zambianisation.

65. He observed that traditional manpower planning, i.e., the matching of skilled manpower requirements to development plan targets using the forecasting and projection approach was prevalent in Zambia. Despite human resources objectives stated in development plans, human resources planning had not been treated as a goal of macro-economic policy. Government responses to human resources problems were ad-hoc and not based on a consistent long-term strategy.

66. With regard to a national training policy, Mr. Sampule informed the participants that this policy was being formulated under the auspices of the Management Development Unit of the Cabinet Office.

67. On the institutional framework for human resources planning in Zambia, Mr. Sampule said that this was lacking as human resources planning, development and utilization programmes had been designed and implemented in an isolated and fragmented manner with no overall policy guidelines for common reference.

68. The need for setting up an efficient human resources planning machinery in Zambia had been realised. The Third Development Plan had suggested the establishment of a human resources planning and development committee which was to be a high-powered policy formulation body with the NCDP as its Secretariat. The Committee was not established but the Manpower Planning and Research Department was set up at NCDP in 1980.

69. A National Manpower Council (NMC) was also suggested to be established at NCDP. Its main function was going to be the co-ordination of human resources policies in the whole economy. The previous Government approved (in October 1991) the formation of NMC but its modus operation was not stated. The lack of institutional machinery coupled with LMI problems contributed to the serious distortions in the country's human resources utilization and development situation.

70. The lack of co-ordination is evidenced by inappropriate educational outputs such as over-supply of liberal arts graduates amid critical skilled manpower shortages in sciences, engineering, etc.

71. He identified the following institutions as being responsible for human resources matters in Zambia: NCDP, the Ministry of Labour and Social Security, the Ministry of Education; Ministry of Vocational and Technical Training, Science and Technology; Directorate of Manpower Development and Training (DMDT), the Ministries of Health and Agriculture, Management Services Board, the Zambia Federation of Employers, Zambia Consolidated Copper Mines Ltd (ZCCM) and Zambia Industrial and Mining Corporation (ZIMCO).

72. These institutions had no clearly defined functional responsibilities and had, therefore, failed to solve some of the outstanding labour market and other human resources problems. The institutions also suffered from the lack of capable and well trained personnel.

73. Mr. Sampule proposed an institutional framework to strengthen human resources policy formulation and implementation. A legal framework was needed to allocate functional responsibilities among the various institutions. LMI collection agencies also needed to be strengthened and co-ordinated so as to reduce duplicity of effort. Without an efficient institutional arrangement, integrating human resources issues in the national development process would be difficult.

74. The NMC which was to be established was to be responsible for policy formulation and co-ordination; monitoring and evaluation. The council was to be composed of the Ministries and agencies which had major responsibilities related to human resources matters in both the public and private sectors.

75. The NMC was, unlike in the past, expected to set up guidelines to re-orient human resources planning towards meeting the requirements of the private and agricultural sectors. To enhance its effectiveness, increased training was envisaged so as to improve the capabilities of those who were to be charged with human resources planning activities. The participants were informed that NCDP, with the assistance of ILO and UNDP, had organised a Workshop on "Data and Information Requirements for Human Resources Planning and Management in Zambia" in October 1991. The Workshop recommended the establishment of a more effective mechanism for data collection as well as the channels for its dissemination. The Workshop also made proposals for an institutional arrangement that would ensure a co-ordinated approach to human resources planning, development and utilization in Zambia.

76. Under the foregoing arrangements, data from the districts and provinces (for the public sector) would be transmitted to DMDT which will in turn transmit it to the Manpower Information Unit of the Personnel Division and finally to the NMC's Technical Committee at NCDP. In the private sector, the Labour Statistics Unit in the Ministry of Labour and Social Security was to be responsible for collecting data at the establishment level and then pass it on to DMDT which would in turn transmit it to NCDP through Personnel Division.

77. For the parastatal sector, ZIMCO was to be responsible for collecting and transmitting the data to the Ministry of Commerce and Industry which would, in turn, transmit it to Cabinet Office and finally NCDP. The Ministry of Local Government would be responsible for collecting and transmitting data on the rural and urban sectors. Through the above proposals, an institutional linkage for collecting and transmitting human resources data could be enhanced.

78. The other recommendations of the workshop included:

a. the formulation of a clear national human resources policy;
b. the easing of human resources planning specialist manpower by either increasing recruitment or training or both;
c. the rationalisation of the operations and co-ordination of existing institutional structures charged with human resources policy formulation and implementation,
d. the need for CSO to hold regular workshops to sensitize personnel managers, directors, etc. on the importance of quality human resources data in national development
e. making a bachelor's degree the minimum academic qualification for human resources planning staff;
f. creating a Bureau of Human Resources Statistics to assemble data and information from all institutions and the transmit it to the NMC; and
g. instituting a legal framework to oblige employers to provide data and information on human resources.

79. Mr. Sampule concluded his paper by saying that the previous Government's approval of the formation of NMC indicated the realisation of the importance of strengthening the

institutional machinery for the formulation, co-ordination, monitoring and implementation of human resources planning in Zambia. Zambia's development, he said, could only be initiated and sustained only if her human resources were developed and well utilised.

80. In discussing the paper a number of observations were made by the participants. These included the following:

(i) the capability of CSO needed to be beefed up so as to improve the quality and availability of statistics;
(ii) the existing institutions had to be fully utilised. Creating new ones could only aggravate co-ordination problems as the problems of bureaucracy were likely to manifest themselves;
iii) there was a need for a clear definition of the kind and purpose of the data to be collected, from where and by whom;
(iv) the requirement for making a bachelor's degree the minimum academic qualified was necessitated by the fact that the present incumbents' academic qualifications were too low to render them untrainable;
(v) NCDP was undergoing reforms and the new Government's was determined to adopt a free market system. In which case, indicative and not central planning would need to be done. It was therefore not clear as to what would happen to the Fourth National Development if the NCDP was reformed;
(vi) the Fourth Development Plan had not been implemented. Instead, it was superseded by the Public Investment Programme and the Social Action Programme; and
vii) the task of formulating and implementing a clear-cut human resources policy based on the various suggestions contained in this report and other similar documents was imperative.

## HUMAN RESOURCES PLANNING IN ZAMBIA

81. Mr. J. Billings of the Management Development Unit (a three year project funded by UNDP) of Cabinet Office started by observing that planning was a budget-driven exercise in Zambia. That is, it was centred around the resources spent during the previous financial year and the resources currently available for the forthcoming financial year. This type of planning had problems of accountability as it did not address itself to whether the objectives of an organization or ministry had been fulfilled or not. So long the organization could prove that the resources had been spent as arranged, the Ministry of Finance would not raise any queries. The questions of whether the nation was better-off or not were never addressed. He therefore suggested that accountability could also be based on whether the resources spent accomplished the nation's developmental goals.

82. He also observed that certain actions such as the reduction of the civil service were done with inadequate information. For example, the exercise envisaged cutting the payroll by a given amount. It did not, however, specify the process through which this could have

been achieved. For example, the notion that the civil-service had a huge number of ghost workers was found to be a fallacy as the actual investigations carried out found that the problem was very minimal. Cutting the payroll could, therefore, not be effected. This demonstrated the fact that ad-hoc decision making was prevalent in Zambia.

83. The Zambian public sector had no performance management system, that is the setting of performance targets and the schedule of action necessary to achieve the stated goals. For performance management to be institutionalised, there was a need for Cabinet Office to liaise with the Ministry of Finance with a view to improving the human condition in Zambia. Under this scheme, the various line ministries would state their objectives and be judged on how these are fulfilled. For example, the Ministry of Health envisaged attaining health for all by the turn of the century. However, the Ministry did not seem to have any strategic planning -- that is, action plans for achieving short-, medium - and long-term objectives.

84. In discussing Mr. Billings' paper, the following observations were made:

(a) some civil-service's objectives could not be quantifiable and thus make target-setting difficult. It was pointed out, however, that this was no excuse as some private companies in the services industry (similar to the civil-service) set up performance standards which had to be met in response to the needs of their customers;

(b) under the current budget-driven planning, targets and/or objectives could only be set after funding had been secured. This made planning ad-hoc and haphazard.

(c) the Ministry of Finance engaged in wholesale cutting of expenditure to match the available resources without considering which particular functions are of vital importance to the development and utilization of human resources and, therefore, to the national development process; and

(d) it was difficult to determine whether the civil-service was over-employed or not as, first, complete information was not available and, second, the objectives and/or functions of the various ministries and agencies were not well documented. However, the effectiveness of the civil-service needed to be improved.

## ISSUES AND ELEMENTS OF MANPOWER POLICY FORMULATION AND IMPLEMENTATION

85. In presenting this paper, the ECA resource person started by saying that the objectives of socio-economic transformation and long-term development in Africa presented formidable challenges to Africa's human resources planners. Socio-economic transformation and long-term development would only be enhanced to the extent that Africa's human resources base was expanded and strengthened. He said that to do this, human resources management had to change its orientation to concentrate on labour market analysis and information necessary for formulating realistic manpower policies which took into account

Africa's socio-economic needs. For a comprehensive human resources management system to be functional, there was a need for an institutional arrangement which was capable of harmonising the various national development objectives.

86. On the issue of what a human resources package should provide, the ECA's resource person argued that it could provide (a) a guide to administrative decision-making on human resources planning, development and utilization (HRPDU), (b) the national objectives on HRPDU, (c) a framework for integrating HRPDU activities in national development planning and (d) the legal framework for executing HRPDU.

87. With regard to labour market information (LMI) and its role in HRPDU, the ECA resource person said that this was the main pre-requisite for human resources policy formulation and implementation as it made it possible to analyze the critical factors which influenced the supply of and demand for labour. He listed the reasons which made traditional manpower planning processes unsuitable for manpower analysis and the formulation of appropriate policies. The LMI which was superseding traditional manpower planning was characterised by a stronger focus on regular reporting and analysis of labour market situations and trends so as to detect imbalances, and a greater concern with manpower and employment issues in the rural and informal sectors.

88. Since employment had three main aspects (production, income and esteem), the main tenet of employment planning was to maximise job opportunities by monitoring the existing employment situation in a country and to estimate the employment needs which had to be generated over a specified time period. The main objective was that of transforming the rapidly growing population into an effective manpower that would be employable either on a self-basis or as workers. The ECA resource person observed that employment planning depended on the establishment of an efficient LMI system.

89. For the purposes of planning, the adequacy of LMI could be judged on the following criteria: comprehensiveness, up-to-datedness, availability to users, credibility and cost-effectiveness. In Africa, evidence from ILO studies showed that LMI had yet to fully receive the attention it deserved was cited. However, attempts by some African countries to improve LMI were reviewed. The technical and organizational constraints which afflicted LMI in Africa were cited. The technical constraints included limited and defective coverage; the neglect of the informal and agricultural sectors; and the non-existence of data on migration and mobility of workers.

90. The organizational constraints included the lack of experienced and trained manpower; the lack of consultation between producers and users of LMI; the delays in processing and publication of LMI; financial constraints; the lack of co-ordination and consultative machinery to effect LMI; and the difficulties of obtaining the desired data from correct sources due to official or administrative embargoes.

91. The presentation then dwelled on the critical factors which had to be taken into account in formulating human resources objectives and policies. They included the analysis

of the impact of population dynamics on the provision of health and social services, educational and training systems; the national political, social and economic objectives. The critical areas which human resources planning had to address itself to were planning and programming; execution of human resources development programmes; and the management of human resources utilization.

(i) Planning and Programming

92. The emphasis would be on analyzing the country's capacity to provide human resources quality enhancing services. In particular specific questions had to be asked in relation to whether there are administrative and technical capabilities in a country to transform the existing population into effective human resources; the extent to which planned and on-going investment activities could absorb the growing labour force; the direction and trend of migration within and outside the nation; and the institutional and legal frame work for human resources policy formulation and implementation.

(ii) Human Resources Development

93. This had to be based on the following premises; to ensure that the existing and future workers were fully developed, and regard human resources development as investment. These concerns could, among other things, be addressed through a clear definition of the requested institutional machinery to develop, execute, monitor and co-ordinate the various educational and training programmes; increase interactions between the training systems and the labour market; making education relevant by reorienting it to problem-solving; placing emphasis on basic education and scientific and technical manpower; etc.

(iii) Human Resources Utilization

94. This involved the creation of employment opportunities and the setting of standards for improving labour productivity. The attainment of these objectives would ensure the productive participation of the population in the development process and thereby ensure a favourable political, social and economic environment. The main issues which were to be considered included determining the natural rate of unemployment; the desired labour force participation rates of the different groups; the types of on-the-job and apprenticeship training schemes to complement the national educational and training programmes; the impact of monetary and fiscal policies on technical innovations; and institutional factors such as employment protection legislation.

95. On the actions required to ensure acceptability and implementation of the formulated human resources policies, the ECA resource person said that there was the need for stating who was responsible for what. It was also necessary to have a clear understanding of the nature and extent of the problems the policy instruments were supposed to resolve; and a criteria for evaluating the success or failure of the policy instruments. The policies formulated had to be approved, ratified and interpreted correctly to the various institutions which were to implement them; commitment to the formulated policies through the prescription of adequate regulations to ensure uniform understanding; designation of

responsibilities for implementing the policies, etc. had to be sought.

96. A well co-ordinated institutional framework was necessary for human resources planning, development and utilization. The human resources planning agency's responsibilities were to undertake overall supervision and control of national human resources planning activities; co-ordinating manpower studies and surveys to generate the necessary data; assist other institutions on the ways and means of strengthening the formulation and implementation of human resources policies. The private and public sector employers were, on the other hand, to be responsible for the provision of the necessary manpower data and information as required by law; develop firm-level human resources policies; etc.

97. The ECA resource person concluded his paper by emphasising the importance of LMI and institutional collaboration and co-ordination in human resources policy formulation and implementation.

98. In the discussion of the paper that followed, participants focused on LMI, investment in human resources development and whether Zambia is in a position to come up with a comprehensive and well co-ordinated HRPDU. On LMI, it was observed that the Ministry of Labour was preoccupied with industrial relations matters only. As a consequence, its Labour Statistics Unit had yet to come up with the data needed for HRPDU. On the other hand, the CSO's Labour Statistics Unit carried out an annual labour force inquiry survey and also, in 1991, conducted an Establishments Census. In addition it also undertook annual surveys of the agricultural sector.

99. The need for easing the statistical personnel constraints through establishment of statistical training programmes in Zambia was identified. It was further argued that the lack of statistical training facilities necessitate foreign training. However, the latter encouraged labour turnover for the returning graduates as the demand for statistical skills had been on the increase. Financial constraint were said to account for the delay in the publication of the labour force survey of 1986 and other similar surveys. It was recommended that collaboration and co-ordination was needed between the Central Statistical Office and the Ministry of Labour.

100. With particular reference to paragraphs 26 and 27 of the paper which suggested perceiving human resources development as investment and increasing access to higher education, respectively, the issue of who should pay for this investment was raised. That is, basic education had, from a social point of view, higher returns but lower returns at the individual level. Higher education, on the other hand, had higher private returns. It was resolved that while basic education was socially more profitable, the technological advancement needs of the country - which could only be promoted by higher education - entailed that higher education had to be supported. Thus, there was a need for increasing public expenditure (investment) on both basic and higher education.

101. On the question of whether Zambia is in a position to come up with a comprehensive and well co-ordinated human resources planning, development and utilization policy systems, it was observed that the country already had a base to start the process. What was needed

was just to improve upon the existing institutional machinery instead of creating new ones so as to reduce costs. It was argued, for example, that the Manpower Information Unit at Personnel Division could be beefed up so as to increase its capacity to collect and disseminate the already available LMI. It was further recognised that many of the Institutions charged with producing LMI (CSO, Directorate for Manpower Development and Training, Personnel Division, etc.) had a number of vital information but, however, the problem was that of not publishing the available information. Where published, the publications had not been disseminated as widely as possible so as to increase the information flow.

## TECHNIQUES AND PROCEDURES FOR THE PREPARATION AND CONDUCT OF MANPOWER SURVEYS - THE ZAMBIAN CASE

102. Mr. G. Moyo started his paper by saying that the first manpower survey was undertaken in 1965. Four Government agencies collaborated in that survey: the Ministry of Labour (undertook the field work); the Establishment Division (provided information on the civil-service); the Directorate of Manpower and Training (provided information on the civil-service training programmes); and the Central Statistical Office (data analysis and presentation). The survey covered both the government and private sectors. Skilled and educated manpower was defined as those with Form 2 education or above.

103. The survey used a questionnaire and the main data types required were total employment, output, existing vacancies, estimated future output, and expected employment and investment for each of the three years from 1965 to 1968. The coverage of the private and local government was not complete and estimates had to be made. For the Central Government, the coverage was complete and thus there was no need for estimates.

104. The main objectives of the survey was to determine the extent of skilled and educated manpower shortages which needed to be resolved if Zambia was to lay a foundation for sustained socio-economic development.

105. The objectives of the 1983 manpower survey were, among others, to provide data for formulating a manpower policy for the forthcoming development plan; to determine whether skilled manpower were available in sufficient quantities to achieve the economic development objectives; to serve as a bench-mark for making projections of occupations requiring many years of education and training; to help assist in planning the expansion of educational and training facilities; and to provide guidelines to the employers to establish on-the-job training and apprenticeship programmes.

106. Three special committees were formed: The first one was responsible for the preparation of the tabulation plan, questionnaires, sample design and operational instructions for the field staff. The second committee was responsible for printing of the survey materials, recruitment of field staff and general administration of the survey operations. The third committee was responsible for the preparation of the editing and coding manuals.

107. The survey established a frame of a list of establishments with one or more employees. The establishments were categorised by sector and location. However, due to financial constraints, the survey was confined to the urban provinces (Copperbelt, Central, Southern and Lusaka) which had the highest concentration of employees.

108. With regard to the sample design, all establishments with 300 or more employees were included in the public, parastatals (in non-mining) and private sectors. Those with less than 10 employees were included if they belonged to a major industrial group. A 20 percent sample of the remaining establishments were selected systematically.

109. In the mining and quarrying sector, all ZCCM Divisions with 10,000 employees or more were included in the sample. All establishments in the local government sector were also included. In the former case, a 20 percent sample of the remaining establishments were randomly selected.

110. In the educational sector, three strata were formed: all higher education institutions were included in the sample; two 20 percent random samples were selected from secondary and primary schools respectively.

111. Mr. Moyo then said that the cooperation of the respondents was obtained through publicity and by making reference to a legal instrument which obliged all employers and employees to provide the necessary information to the Central Statistical Office.

112. Two questionnaires were administered: one for employers and another one for employees. The employers' questionnaire sought information on economic activities engaged in, total employment by earnings, sex, nationality and by occupations, vacant posts, and reasons why, training and years of experience in each occupation, future staff requirements and expansion plans, and availability of in-service training programmes.

113. The employees' questionnaire, on the other hand, sought information on age, sex, marital status, nationality, earnings, experience, education and training.

114. In all, there were four categories of field staff: master trainers, provincial officers, supervisors and enumerators. The processing of the data was done by a United Nations Data Processing Advisor with the help of the Data Processing Unit of the Central Statistical Office.

115. Some of the problems encountered during the administration of the survey were:

(a) the delivery of questionnaires to employees who were working at different locations took more time than expected;
(b) certain types of information in the employers' questionnaire could not be provided by branches because it was kept by head offices;
(c) some respondents could not differentiate between job titles and job descriptions;
(d) highly paid and expatriate staff refused to disclose information on their earning and their educational attainment;

(e) data processing was delayed because of other commitments such as the 1980 population census data analysis.

116. On the question of what form manpower surveys should take in Zambia, Mr. Moyo said that it might not be advisable to try to obtain manpower information directly from employees' personal records as all the information required could not be documented. Administrative data also suffers from the problem of nomenclatures, different reference periods, and incompatible formats.

117. The Central Statistical Office could collaborate with the big institutions such as ZIMCO, ZCCM, INDECO, NCDP, etc. which had centralised records. Such bench-mark information could be up-dated regularly. The big institutions could specialise in collecting the information in the field of their domain and Central Statistical Office could cover the private sector and the smaller public establishments.

118. To improve the collection of quality data, he suggested the need for a full list (frame) of all establishments in the central and local governments, parastatals and private sectors. The list would show current employment levels, economic activities, locations, etc. Such a list could help to draw a sample to make estimates for the entire population. The country had to be divided into sectors (with each sector stratified), with establishments listed according to industry and employment size.

119. On the administration of the survey, there was a need to form a special committee made up of management, LMI producers and major data users. The tasks of the committee would be mobilising financial resources, tabulation plans, questionnaires, sample designs,etc.

120. On data processing and dissemination, Mr. Moyo said that the government had to attract and retain the necessary qualified manpower. The four available qualified manpower in the Labour Statistics Unit of CSO were over employed and this had tended to reduce their effectiveness. The provision of equipment, material and transport facilities would ease some of the major problems faced in administering surveys.

121. The responsibility of disseminating the survey results should be clearly defined. The previous practices of leaving out the dissemination aspects out of the budget should not recur. The printing and publishing potential of the Central Statistical Office would have to be exploited.

122. In the discussion of the paper,the following observations were made by participants:

(a) the paper did not mention nor did it address the labour force survey of 1986. The participants were told that a labour force survey was different from a manpower survey as the former covered both households and establishments (i.e. both the employed and the unemployed, their characteristics, etc); the latter, on the other hand, concentrated on establishments (employed manpower). The labour force survey was not part of the terms of reference of the paper.

(b) the manpower surveys data could not be used to make forecasts as it ignored occupational mobility and wastage. However, it was pointed out, these aspects could be included in the questionnaires and also by the questions relating to whether a company had expansion plans or not;

(c) the fact that there had been no manpower survey since 1983 suggested that there could have been no demand for the type of information generated and, by implication, no meaningful human resources planning had been done over the period. This could also be explained by the fact that surveys were budget driven -- that is, done when resources permitted and not necessarily in the interest of the nation;

(d) the kind of data Central Statistical Office collects should be demand-driven. However, few local institutions ever approached Central Statistical Office as to what exact data types they wanted. Of late, much of the surveys which were being undertaken were donor-driven. For example, the fortnightly prices survey were due to the demands of the IMF and the World Bank; and

(e) it may be necessary to conduct more than one type of survey at the same time so as to achieve economies of scale. However, this had the problem of stretching both human and financial resources to the limit.

## GROUP REPORT

## A REVIEW OF THE EXISTING NATIONAL MANPOWER PLANNING INSTITUTIONS IN RELATION TO THEIR STRUCTURE, LOCATION, STAFFING POSITION AND FUNCTIONS AS WELL AS THE LINKAGES[2]

### A. Institutions

123. The Group identified various institutions and organisations in Zambia which were created to address Human Resources issues.

124. In the public sector, the following key institutions were involved in Human Resources Planning, Development and Utilization:

a. Ministry of General Education
b. Ministry of Vocational and Technical Training, Science and Technology
c. National Commission for Development Planning
d. Management Services Board
e. Cabinet Office (Personnel Division, Directorate of Manpower Development and Training)
f. Ministry of Labour and Social Security

---

[2]For the terms of reference of the Group see appendix A. The Group, despite the information it collected from the three ministries it visited, did not address itself to the specified terms of reference.

g. Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Fisheries
h. Ministry of Health
i. Ministry of Information and Continuing Education, etc.

However, it was noted that all Government Ministries had some aspects of Human Resources Planning, Development and Utilization.

125. In the parastatal sector, human resources units were to be found in ZCCM, INDECO and ZIMCO Groups of companies. In view of the fact that no participants came from some of the above key ministries, the group decided to visit the Ministries of Education, Labour and Social Security, and Vocational and Technical Training Science and Technology so as to get to get first hand information on their structures, functions, etc.

## B. Functions

126. The functions performed by the institutions visited varied. For example, the main function of the Ministry of Education was to develop human resources through primary and secondary education – that is, basic and secondary education. The Ministry of Vocational and Technical Training, Science and Technology was responsible for tertiary and higher education (that is, both scientific and non-scientific pre-employment training) in Zambia. These included all the teacher training colleges, the technical and trades institutes, and the Universities of the Copperbelt and Zambia.

127. The Ministry of Labour and Social Security was responsible for the placement of unskilled labour through its employment exchange offices throughout Zambia. Its Employment and Occupational Assessments Service provided psychological services to both public and private employers during recruitment exercises. The Department of Labour was responsible for industrial relations, workers' safety at the places of work, collection of data on employment and other conditions of service, etc. The newly formed Department of Social Security would be responsible for administering workers' social security contributions.

## C. Constraints and proposals for action

128. The most frequently mentioned constraints included:-

- inadequate funding;
- shortage of skilled manpower;
- lack of transport;
- lack of effective coordination among the various institutions;
- high staff turnover due to uncompetitive conditions of service;
- lack of clear-cut national human resources policy.

129. Basing their analysis on the documents and papers presented at the workshop, the Group was of the opinion that the existing institutional framework for human resources planning was characterised by the lack of coordination and guidelines for common reference. There was no clearly defined legal framework to allocate functional responsibilities among

institutions and organizations involved in human resources planning. For example, at the Ministry of Labour the Group was told that NCDP had no authority to instruct the former to do any particular activity even if that activity was deemed by the latter to national importance in terms of human resources management. However, NCDP could consult the Ministry of Labour and then agree on a course of action to resolve the identified problem.

130. In addition, the institutions dealing with human resources matters had problems of insufficient staff and those available often lacked relevant training to equip them with skills required to perform their functions more effectively. There was, therefore, a great need to embark on training programmes for the staff. Such training could help the various institutions to develop the necessary inter- and intra-institutional communication channels which could bring about a harmonised and coordinated human resources planing, development and utilisation system both at the national and sectoral levels.

131. The group endorsed the previous government's approval of the formation of the National Manpower Council (NMC) and expressed the wish that the new Government would regard the establishment of this vital institution as one of its top priorities. The envisaged functions of the NMC of assuming overall responsibility for human resources policy formulation, coordination, implementation, and evaluation for both the public and private sectors would contribute, significantly, to the establishment of a clearly defined institutional framework necessary for effective human resources management in Zambia.

132. The group also recommended the imperativeness of the realignment of the existing structures/institutions in the country which were charged with human resources matters to ensure institutional collaboration and coordination in the planning, development and utilisation of human resources. The need for strengthening the Manpower Planning Department at the National Commission for Development Planning so as to make human resources planning effective and responsive to the needs of the country was also recognised.

## EVALUATION OF THE WORKSHOP

133. On the question of how the participants rated the scheduling of the workshop, effectiveness of presentations and group discussions and the usefulness of workshop documents, the table below gives the distribution of their responses.

| | Very Good | Good | Satisfactory | Fair | Unsatisfactory |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1. the scheduling of the programme of work? | 1 (14) | 4 (57) | - | 2 (29) | - |
| 2. the effectiveness of the lectures? | 1 (14) | 3 (43) | 2 (29) | 1 (14) | - |
| 3. the effectiveness of group discussions? | 2 (29) | 1 (14) | 4 (57) | - | - |
| 4. the usefulness and clarity of workshop documents? | 1 (14) | 4 (57) | 2 (29) | - | - |

**NB**: figures in brackets are percentages.

134. The following comments were made with regard to the four questions above:

a. some of the participants were not directly involved in human resources planning and policy formulation and, consequently, this limited effective discussion of the related issues;
b. the workshop should have been held earlier in the year before the budget for the following year was made so that some of the recommendations of the workshop could have been incorporated for implementation;
c. presentation skills of some local resource persons (both written and spoken) could have been improved; and
d. there was a need to acquire skills in conducting group meetings and discussions.

135. On the question of the length of the workshop sessions, six participants thought that they were just right and one thought that they were too short. On participation and usefulness of such participation, all of them said that the discussions enabled them to share their experiences and learn from one another.

136. With regard to what the participants disliked most, the following were their observations (the numbers in parentheses represent the frequency):

a. poor attendance especially from the key ministries of education and labour (7),
b. poor time up-keep of the attending participants (4),
c. poor presentation skills of some local resource persons (2), and
d. poor quality of meals (especially lunches) provided by NIPA (1)

137. The following were what the participants liked most:

a. the ECA resource person had first hand knowledge of Zambia's human resources planning, development and utilisation problems and, accordingly, he was able to address the various issues in the Zambian context (1);
b. there was effective participation by those who attended the workshop (6);
c. workshop documents were useful and informative (1); and
d. resource persons made good presentations (1).

138. As to whether the participants could recommend a similar workshop to colleagues who did not attend this particular one, six of them responded to this question in the affirmative. The negative response to this question was based on the premise that since there was no clearly stated national human resources planning, development and utilisation policy in Zambia, doing so would be a waste of time as the resultant recommendations could not be implemented.

139. The responding participants made the following recommendations which they thought could improve future similar workshops:

a. the target group should be identified clearly so as to maximise the benefits;
b. the workshop should be residential and held outside Lusaka so as to enable

participants concentrate on the documents, improve attendance and time up-keep;

c. participants should be given monetary incentives such as out-of-pocket allowances;
d. candidates nominated to attend similar national workshops should be compelled to do so; and
e. local resource persons should not all be drawn from one institution. A cross-sectional approach was required so as to widen the perspectives of the participants on human resources policies and issues.

## OFFICIAL CLOSURE OF THE WORKSHOP

140. The workshop was officially closed by Mr G.K. Kaira, Permanent Secretary, Personnel Division. But before calling on Mr Kaira, the Principal of NIPA, Dr Bwalya made a few remarks concerning the value of the workshop. Dr Bwalya started by regretting the fact that some key ministries who were invited to attend did not do so and this made the workshop less detailed in its deliberations. He, however, paid tribute to those who attended and hoped that they had learned something from the workshop. He reminded the participants that the main objective of holding workshops was to draw on the experiences of individual participants and to exchange ideas amongst themselves.

141. Dr Bwalya then said that workshops such as the present one would serve no purpose unless their recommendations were implemented and the participants were prepared to disseminate their acquired knowledge to their colleagues who could not attend the workshops. He called for the need to make human resources planning, development and utilisation a priority so as to enhance the effective participation of the vast majority of the population in the national development process.

142. He concluded his remarks by saying that NIPA seeks to improve its standards and reputation and it was in this context that participants had to demonstrate to their colleagues that they had been at NIPA for a seminal workshop.

143. In his closing speech, Mr Kaira started by saying that he was grateful to be invited again to officiate at the closing ceremony of the workshop which had, jointly, been organised by NIPA and UNECA. He observed that the workshop was aimed at sensitizing and improving the analytical skills of the participants with regard to human resources policy formulation and analysis.

144. Mr Kaira then said that much had been said on the importance of human resources development in the economic development of any nation in the world. Time had, therefore, come to concentrate on implementing such pronouncements so as to achieve the desired results. He commended the participants for their efforts during the week they stayed at NIPA.

145. He expressed regret and disappointment at the negative responses from the key ministries and organisations who were invited to send representatives. Such a situation, he

continued, should not be allowed to become a general practice as Zambia needed critical skills and well thought-out human resources policies. The ministries and organisations which did not attend the workshop deprived Zambia of their knowledge and experiences. He named the ministries and organisations which did not attend: the Ministries of Labour and Social Security, Education, and Finance; Zambia Consolidated Copper Mines (ZCCM); the Zambia Industrial and Mining Corporation (ZIMCO) Headquarters; and the Zambia Federation of Employers.

146. Mr Kaira concluded his speech by congratulating the participants and resource persons for their hard work during the course of the workshop; and the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa for providing the main resource person.

## APPENDIX A

## TIME TABLE AND WORK SCHEDULE

**MONDAY DECEMBER 9**

| | |
|---|---|
| 8.00-9.30 | Registration of participants and collection of workshop documents. |
| 9.30-10.30 | Official Opening of the Workshop<br>Statement by representative of the Government of Zambia |
| 10.30-11.00 | Tea Break |
| 11.00-12.30 | The Status, Policies and Programmes of Human Resources Planning, Development and Utilization in Africa (ECA Resource Person). |
| 12.30-14.00 | LUNCH |
| 14.00-15.00 | Discussion of the ECA Paper. |
| 15.00-15.30 | Tea Break |
| 15.30-17.00 | Review of the structure and performance of Zambian Economy, its impact on employment growth and the national development objectives (Mr Sianga, Manpower Department, NCDP). |

**TUESDAY, DECEMBER 10**

| | |
|---|---|
| 8.00-9.00 | Discussion of the Zambian Economy (Chaired by the ECA Resource Person). |
| 9.00-10.30 | Review of the status and effectiveness of human resources planning institutions and programmes in Zambia (Mr Sampule, NCDP -- Manpower Department) |
| 10.30-11.00 | Tea Break |
| 11.00-12.30 | Discussion of Human Resources Planning in Zambia (Chairman to be selected from the participants) |
| 12.30-14.00 | Lunch |
| 14.00-15.30 | Issues and elements of manpower policy formulation and administration (ECA) |
| 15.30-16.00 | Tea Break |
| 16.00-17.00 | Discussion of the Issues and Elements Paper. |

**WEDNESDAY DECEMBER 11**

8.00-10.30 GROUP DISCUSSION:

*Human Resources Planning, Development and Utilisation Institutional Machinery*

This group will review the existing national manpower planning machineries in

relation to their structure, location, staffing position and functions as well as the linkages with the view to diagnosing the current scope, limitations and prospects. The terms of reference of the group is to:

i) identify the various institutions charged with human resources matters, their respective functions, and their respective structures (ie. specialised departments within each of them);

ii) determine whether these various institutions are well staffed and resourced;

ii) determine whether there is effective coordination among these institutions (i.e., how these various institutions are related);

iii) identify the various problems which militate against effective human resources planning institutional arrangements in Zambia;

iv) develop proposals and guidelines for action with respect to the structure, functions (terms of reference) and staffing requirements for a comprehensive human resources planning institutional machinery in Zambia.

*NB: Due to the fact that the Ministries of Education, Labour and Finance did not turn up, this group had to go around these institutions to interview senior officials on the issues contained in its terms of reference. This exercise took the rest of the day. Discussion of these findings and writing up of its report were done on Thursday*

**THURSDAY DECEMBER 12**

| | |
|---|---|
| 8.30-10.30 | Group discussion continued. |
| 10.30-11.00 | Tea Break |
| 11.00-12.30 | Writing up of the Group report |
| 12.30-14.00 | Lunch |
| 14.00-15.30 | Techniques and procedures for the preparation and conduct of manpower surveys in Zambia (Mr Moyo, Central Statistical Office) |
| 15.30-16.00 | Tea Break |
| 16.00-17.00 | Discussion of Mr Moyo's paper. |

**FRIDAY DECEMBER 13**

| | |
|---|---|
| 8.00-9.30 | Finalisation of Group Report |
| 9.30-10.30 | Evaluation of workshop |
| 10.30-11.00 | Tea Break |
| 11.00-12.30 | Closing of the Workshop by a representative of the Zambian Government. |

## APPENDIX B

### LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

| | |
|---|---|
| 1. Mr Richard .J. Lungu | Directorate of Manpower Development and Training, Cabinet Office |
| 2. Mr K.C. Seal | Manpower Information Unit, Cabinet Office. |
| 3. Mrs Theresa Bbuku | Bank of Zambia |
| 4. Mr Lubasi Nyambe | National Commission for Development Planning (NCDP). |
| 5. Ms Lupupa Kabezya | NCDP |
| 6. Mr Aaron Malama | Management Services Board |
| 7. Mr Emmanuel M. Silanda | Central Statistical Office |
| 8. Ms Margaret M.S. Lungu | NIPA |
| 9. Mr Edward N. Mwela | Zambia Breweries Limited |
| 10. Mr James Mazyopa | Zambia Congress of Trade Unions. |

### RESOURCE PERSONS

1. Dr Mushiba Nyamazana, ECA, Addis Ababa.
2. Mr Coillard Hamabuyu, National Institute for Public Administration
3. Mr S. Sianga, National Commission for Development Planning
4. Mr A. Sampule, National Commission for Development Planning
5. Mr G. Moyo, Central Statistical Office
6. Mr J. Billings, Management Development Unit, Cabinet Office.